Bounary-Layer Meteorol manuscript No. (will be inserted by the editor)

¹ Bluff-body flow separation in the lee of a crater rim

- ² Manuela Lehner \cdot C. David Whiteman \cdot
- $_3$ Sebastian W. Hoch \cdot Bianca Adler \cdot
- 4 Norbert Kalthoff

6 Received: DD Month YEAR / Accepted: DD Month YEAR

Abstract The nearly circular Meteor Crater, Arizona, is located on an exten-7 sive, slightly sloping plain, above which a southwesterly katabatic flow forms 8 during undisturbed, clear-sky nights. As the katabatic wind flows over the upstream crater rim, the resulting flow regime in the lee depends on the upstream 10 wind speed. For a shallow katabatic flow with comparatively low wind speeds, 11 the flow decelerates as it approaches the crater. Cold-air intrusions form, that 12 is, cold air spills over the crater rim and runs down the inner southwest side-13 wall. For a deep katabatic flow with comparatively high wind speeds, the flow 14 accelerates towards the crater. The flow separates in the immediate lee of the 15 crater rim, forming a wake over the southwest crater sidewall. The wake can 16 either be small, affecting only the upper part of the sidewall, or large, affecting 17 the entire crater sidewall or even the crater floor. 18 When flow separation occurs, the wake region over the crater sidewall is 19 characterized by low wind speeds and potentially a return circulation near 20 the surface. Particularly for large wakes, stability in the crater atmosphere is 21

the sufface. Farticularly for large wakes, stability in the crater atmosphere is
 reduced and relatively high wind speeds can occur at the crater floor, which
 is otherwise submerged in a strong surface-based inversion. Turbulent kinetic
 energy at the crater sidewall is typically higher during cold-air intrusions than

 $_{25}$ during flow separation, but high values can occur at the floor when a large

²⁶ wake forms.

Keywords Bluff-body flow separation · Flow over topography · Lee vortex ·
 METCRAX II · Wake

M. Lehner Department of Atmospheric and Cryospheric Sciences, University of Innsbruck, Innrain 52f, 6020 Innsbruck, Austria E-mail: manuela.lehner@uibk.ac.at

C. D. Whiteman and S. W. Hoch Department of Atmospheric Sciences, University of Utah, Salt Lake City, Utah, USA

B. Adler and N. Kalthoff Karlsruhe Institute of Technology, Karlsruhe, Germany

29 1 Introduction

As air flow interacts with topography, that is, as air is either forced to flow over 30 mountains or depressions or to flow around them, the resulting flow regimes 31 and processes depend strongly on flow characteristics (i.e., stability and speed) 32 and on topographic characteristics (e.g., mountain height and width, lateral 33 extension, slope angle, and surface roughness) (e.g., Vosper 2004; Jackson et al. 34 2012; Lehner et al. 2016a; Rotunno and Lehner 2016). As air flows around 35 obstacles, vertical-axis vortices can form in the lee (e.g. Smolarkiewicz and 36 Rotunno 1989; Katurji et al. 2013). The resulting wake region in the lee is 37 typically characterized by reduced mean wind speeds and high turbulence 38 (Katurji et al. 2013). Lee vortices with a horizontal axis, on the other hand, 39 can form as air flows over obstacles and separates from the surface in the lee, 40 resulting, for example, in turbulent rotors (e.g. Doyle and Durran 2007) or 41 recirculation zones in the immediate lee of the mountain (e.g., Gerber et al. 42 2017; Menke et al. 2018). 43

Boundary-layer or flow separation in the lee of obstacles can occur due 44 to the presence of an adverse pressure gradient that causes a deceleration of 45 the flow, particularly in the near-surface layer (e.g., Wood 1995; Belcher and 46 Hunt 1998; Ambaum and Marshall 2005). Baines (1995) defines three differ-47 ent boundary-layer-separation regimes based on laboratory experiments: (i) 48 boundary-layer separation at the mountain crest (i.e., bluff-body flow separa-49 tion), (ii) flow separation farther down the lee sidewall below the first wave 50 crest, which he calls post-wave separation, and (iii) complete attachment, that 51 is, no separation occurs. The three flow types are characterized by their lo-52 cation in a regime diagram as a function of H/W and NH/U, where H is 53 the mountain height, W is the length of the lee slope, N is the buoyancy fre-54 quency, and U is the upstream wind speed. The formation of bluff-body flow 55 separation depends on the ratio between the wavelength of the internal waves 56 $2\pi U/N$ and W so that boundary-layer separation can occur if $NW/U < \pi$. 57 Post-wave separation, on the other hand, can occur when NH/U is above a 58 critical threshold value. 59

Ambaum and Marshall (2005) derived a vorticity equation to describe ac-60 celerations and decelerations for flow over a hill. They assumed that flow-61 separation will occur if the decrease in flow speed is large enough, that is, of 62 the same order of magnitude as the unperturbed base-state velocity. For small 63 aspect ratios (i.e., small hills) linear solutions to their equation reproduced the 64 regime diagram by Baines (1995). According to their solutions, the location of 65 flow deceleration and thus flow-separation depends on the flow solution, that 66 is, whether the solution is evanescent or wave-like. For evanescent solutions, 67 deceleration occurs along the lee slope of the hill and flow separation in the im-68 mediate lee of the hill is thus possible if flow deceleration is large enough. For 69 wave-like solutions, deceleration starts farther downstream over the lee slope 70 of the hill. If flow separation occurs, it will thus be in the form of post-wave 71 separation. 72

Post-wave separation is closely related to rotor formation in the lee of 73 mountains. Rotors form when the boundary layer separates from the surface 74 because of adverse horizontal pressure gradients that occur in connection with 75 trapped lee waves (Doyle and Durran 2002, 2007; Vosper 2004). Vertical wind 76 shear close to the surface produces a thin layer of positive vorticity, which is 77 lifted into the wave. Hertenstein and Kuettner (2005) identified a second type 78 of rotor based on numerical simulations, which is reminiscent of a hydraulic 79 jump and which results from negative vorticity being produced by the baro-80 clinicity in connection with the deformation of an inversion layer. The two 81 types of rotors were also observed experimentally in the lee of the Medicine 82 Bow Mountains, Wyoming, by French et al. (2015). 83

Idealized simulations with a two-layer atmosphere by Vosper (2004) showed 84 that if the Froude number $F = U/\sqrt{g'z_i}$ is within a certain range that allows 85 the formation of trapped lee waves and if $H/z_i \ge 0.3$ the wave amplitude 86 becomes large enough to cause rotor formation, where z_i is the depth of the 87 lower layer and $g' = g\Delta\theta/\theta_0$ is the reduced acceleration of gravity, with g 88 the acceleration of gravity, $\Delta \theta$ the potential temperature difference across the 89 inversion separating the lower from the upper layer and θ_0 the reference po-90 tential temperature in the lower layer. Doyle and Durran (2002) defined a 91 non-dimensional pressure gradient threshold criterion for post-wave flow sepa-92 ration based on idealized simulations. Applying this criterion to observations in 93 the lee of the Medicine Bow Mountains, Wyoming, Strauss et al. (2016) found, 94 however, that flow separation can occur for even smaller pressure gradients. 95 They suggest that in addition to pressure-gradient forces, buoyancy forces may 96 contribute to flow deceleration and thus boundary-layer separation. 97 Bluff-body flow separation in the lee of obstacles has been shown in wa-98 ter tank studies (e.g., Baines and Hoinka 1985) and occasional observations 99 100

in the atmosphere have been reported, for example, in the lee of the Sierra Nevada by Grubišić and Doyle (2006). Lidar observations by Gerber et al. 101 (2017) showed recirculation in the lee of the Sattelhorn Ridge in the Dischma 102 Valley, Switzerland, which persisted for more than 16 h with a horizontal 103 extent of 400-1000 m and a vertical extent of up to about 200 m. Indirect 104 observations of flow separation have also been reported. Strauss et al. (2015) 105 observed high turbulence values in the immediate lee of the Medicine Bow 106 Mountains suggesting the presence of bluff-body flow separation. A visualiza-107 tion of horizontal-axis lee vortices occurs when clouds form. Vortices in the 108 immediate lee of mountain peaks have been identified as the most likely for-109 mation mechanism for so-called banner clouds (Wirth et al. 2012; Voigt and 110 Wirth 2013). 111

As indicated by Baines (1995), the occurrence of bluff-body flow separation in the lee of an obstacle depends on the speed of the approaching flow and on the stability. Mason (1987) observed flow separation or decoupling in a small, approximately 200-m deep valley under neutral and unstable conditions, while the flow remained attached under stable conditions with a Froude number smaller than 2, and was able to reproduce that result with numerical simulations. Similar results were found by Holden et al. (2000) based on tethersonde

measurements, who also related the decoupling of the flow to the Richardson 119 number, with decoupling occurring at relatively high Richardson numbers. Ide-120 alized simulations of flow over small basins by Lehner et al. (2016a) produced 121 flow separation over the upstream basin edge in their highest-wind speed sim-122 ulations (15 m s⁻¹) with the deepest basins (100 and 150 m). Menke et al. 123 (2018) probed a recirculation zone in the lee of two parallel mountain ridges 124 in central Portugal at three different cross sections with six scanning Doppler 125 lidars and found that reversed flow greater than 0.5 m s^{-1} occured 50% of the 126 time and that the occurrence of the recirculation zone depended on stability 127 (specifically, most frequent occurrence for near-neutral and unstable condi-128 tions), on wind speed (most frequent occurrence for wind speeds larger than 129 8 m s^{-1}), and on the topography, that is, they observed variations among the 130 three different cross sections. 131

Flow separation also strongly depends on the topography, for example, the 132 sharpness of the mountain top, with separation being more likely in the pres-133 ence of salient edges (Batchelor 1967; Kim et al. 2001). Flow separation and 134 the formation of a recirculation zone in the lee is also facilitated by steeper 135 slopes (Arya et al. 1987; Kim et al. 2001; Wood 1995) and by denser canopies, 136 that is, higher surface roughness (Wood 1995; Poggi and Katul 2007; Patton 137 and Katul 2009). Wood (1995), for example, estimated the critical slope an-138 gle for flow separation based on idealized simulations, finding a lower critical 139 slope angle for higher surface roughness. They also showed that for 2D cases, 140 the separation point moves upstream with increasing hill height and that the 141 recirculation eddy size increases. 142

In this paper we present nighttime observations of bluff-body flow separa-143 tion at the rim of Arizona's Meteor Crater during comparatively high-wind-144 speed periods. The wake that forms over the southwest crater sidewall is char-145 acterized by low wind speeds and sometimes a return flow near the surface, 146 that is, an upslope flow component. Section 2 describes the Meteor Crater and 147 the dataset used in this study. Evidence for flow separation in the lee of the 148 crater rim is presented in Sect. 3. The atmospheric conditions leading to flow 149 separation and the characteristics of the flow in the resulting wake region are 150 described in Sect. 4 and Sect. 5, respectively. Finally, a brief summary and 151 conclusions are given in Sect. 6. 152

153 2 Data and Methods

154 2.1 The Meteor Crater

The Meteor Crater in northern Arizona (35°N, 111°W) is a nearly circular, bowl-shaped basin that was produced by a meteorite impact 49000 yr ago (Fig. 1). It is about 1.2 km in diameter, 170 m in depth, and is surrounded by a rim that extends 30–50 m above the surrounding plain, which rises slightly to the southwest with a slope angle of about 1°. Two major field campaigns, METCRAX (Meteor Crater Experiment; Whiteman et al. 2008)



Fig. 1 Topography of the Meteor Crater with the location of the measurement sites used in this study. Elevation contour lines are at 10-m intervals.

and METCRAX II (Lehner et al. 2016b), took place at the Meteor Crater to 161 study various aspects of the crater meteorology. The focus of METCRAX II in 162 October 2013 was on the flow past the crater basin. During clear-sky, quiescent 163 nights a surface-based inversion and a southwesterly katabatic flow form over 164 the plain surrounding the Meteor Crater, with a typical inversion depth and 165 strength of about 50 m and 0.15 K m^{-1} , respectively, and a jet maximum of 166 5 m s^{-1} at 30 m above ground level (AGL; Whiteman et al. 2018a). Once the 167 depth of the inversion exceeds the height of the crater rim, the cold air starts 168 to drain into the crater over the upwind, southwest rim until the air reaches 169 its level of neutral buoyancy (Whiteman et al. 2018a). This inflow of cold air 170 modifies the nocturnal stratification within the crater, resulting in a shallow 171 and strong surface-based inversion above the crater floor, which is topped by 172 a deep near-isothermal layer and a capping inversion near the top of the crater 173 (Whiteman et al. 2010; Haiden et al. 2011). With a deepening of the katabatic 174 flow upstream and an increase in wind speed, the flow over the crater topog-175 raphy can also lead to the formation of a wave over the basin, which can reach 176 amplitudes exceeding the crater depth (Adler et al. 2012; Whiteman et al. 177 2018b). 178

179 2.2 Data

- 180 The data used in this study come from the METCRAX II experiment. A de-
- tailed description of the METCRAX II field campaign, the measurement sites,

and the instrumentation can be found in Lehner et al. (2016b). The measure-182 ment sites used in this study are shown in Fig. 1. The data come from two 183 lines of hobo temperature data-loggers (Onset Computer, Inc., Bourne, Mas-184 sachusetts), which ran up the northeast and south-southwest crater sidewalls 185 (labeled HNE and HSSW in Fig. 1), with eleven and twelve sensors, respec-186 tively. Instantaneous temperature values were recorded every 2.5 min. A 40-m 187 high tower was installed at the crater rim (RIM), which was instrumented with 188 CSAT3 sonic anemometers and hygrothermometers at 5 m intervals. A simi-189 larly instrumented 50-m high tower was installed about 1.6 km upstream, that 190 is, southwest, of the Meteor Crater (NEAR), with the lowest measurement level 191 at 3 m instead of 5 m to be used as part of a full energy-balance station. Addi-192 tional sonic anemometers were installed at two sites along the south-southwest 193 crater sidewall, 40 (SSW2) and 90 m (SSW4) above the crater floor, and at 194 the crater floor itself (FLR). Wind data from the sonic anemometers were tilt 195 corrected (Wilczak et al. 2001) and turbulence statistics were calculated for 196 5-min averaging intervals from the 20-Hz measurements. Further data come 197 from a network of microbarometers in the crater, specifically at FLR, SSW2, 198 SSW4, a site located in-between SSW2 and SSW4 (SSW3, 70 m above the 199 crater floor), and a site downslope from SSW2 (SSW1, 10 m above the crater 200 floor). Pressure was sampled with a frequency of 1 Hz and averaged over 201 5-min intervals for the analysis. Pressure measurements from the southwest 202 sidewall are analyzed with respect to data from a microbarometer on the rela-203 tively undisturbed northeast sidewall (NNE, 50 m above the crater floor). Sites 204 SSW1, SSW3, and NNE are not labeled in Fig. 1. Turbulence measurements 205 in the immediate lee of the southwest crater rim were made with a surface 206 layer scintillometer (SLS20, Scintec). 207

Data are analyzed for the period 4–29 October, when all of these instru-208 ments were operational. The analysis is restricted to nighttime periods be-209 tween 1800 and 0600 MST and to periods when (i) an inversion was observed 210 at NEAR between the top and the bottom levels of the tower $(T_{50m} - T_{3m} > 0)$ 211 and (ii) the wind direction at 50 m AGL at NEAR was from a southwesterly 212 direction $(165-255^{\circ})$ to indicate a katabatic flow. These criteria had to be met 213 for at least one continuous hour based on 5-min averaged data values for the 214 data to be included in the analysis. 215

²¹⁶ 3 Flow Separation in the Meteor Crater

An analysis of the cold-air intrusions coming over the southwest crater rim 217 during Intensive Observational Period (IOP) 7 (26-27 October) showed tem-218 poral increases in wind speed along the southwest sidewall in connection with 219 changes in the level of neutral buoyancy of the cold air coming over the crater 220 rim (Whiteman et al. 2018a). Specifically, SSW2 in the lower part of the side-221 wall (see Fig. 1) is located close to the top of the shallow (30-40 m) and strong 222 (5–10 K potential temperature change) surface-based inversion, with low wind 223 speeds close to 0 m s^{-1} when unaffected by the intrusions. When the level of 224



Fig. 2 Wind speed at (a) SSW4 and (b) SSW2 as a function of the mean wind speed at RIM. See text for a description of the five different colour-coded categories.

²²⁵ neutral buoyancy of the cold air running down the crater sidewall descends ²²⁶ below SSW2, an increase in wind speed to about $3-5 \text{ m s}^{-1}$ is observed.

Plotting the wind speed along the southwest sidewall at SSW4 and SSW2 227 against the wind speed averaged over the 40-m deep layer sampled at the 228 crater rim for the entire month, however, reveals the presence of two different 229 flow regimes (Fig. 2). In the first or *intrusion regime* with relatively low wind 230 speeds at RIM of less than about 5 m s⁻¹, wind speeds along the sidewall 231 have a similar magnitude as the wind speed at the rim. SSW2 also shows a 232 close-to-linear increase in wind speed with increasing speed at RIM. In the 233 second or separation regime with higher wind speeds at RIM of about 5 m s⁻¹ 234 or more, weak wind speeds, generally less than 2 m s^{-1} are observed along the 235 sidewall and increasing the wind speed at the RIM to 10 m s^{-1} and more does 236 not lead to further increases in wind speed along the sidewall. This suggests 237 the formation of a wake over the sidewall as a result of flow separation in the 238 lee of the crater rim. For wind speeds greater than about 7 m s⁻¹ at the rim, 239 only the flow-separation regime seems to occur. For wind speeds lower than 240 about 7 m s⁻¹, however, either low or high wind speeds can be observed along 241 the sidewall. For very low wind speeds it is of course difficult to distinguish 242 between the two regimes based on the wind speed along the southwest sidewall, 243 because even for the intrusion regime only low wind speeds would be expected 244 to occur. Results similar to Fig. 2 are obtained if the mean wind speed at RIM 245 is replaced with the maximum wind speed over the eight vertical levels, or 246 with the values at the bottom and top of the 40-m tower. The five categories 247 indicated by different colours in Fig. 2 and in the background of Fig. 3 will be 248 discussed in Sect. 4. 249

Figures 3a–c show an example of a cold-air-intrusion dominated night (26–

²⁵¹ 27 October; IOP 7), the same night that was analyzed by Whiteman et al. ²⁵² (2018a). Wind speeds at SSW4 are of a similar magnitude as wind speeds at

5 m AGL at RIM and the wind direction is from the southwest, indicating a 253 flow down the slope (Figs. 3a, b). Wind speeds, and to a lesser degree wind 254 directions, are more variable at SSW2, showing strong increases and decreases 255 in wind speed, which indicate whether the cold-air intrusion penetrates below 256 SSW2 or whether it reaches its level of neutral buoyancy already above SSW2 257 (Whiteman et al. 2018a). A strong inversion is present in the lowest layer of 258 the crater atmosphere, with the potential temperature near the crater floor 259 5–10°C lower than at the crater rim and in the upper part of the northeast 260 sidewall (Fig. 3c). Whiteman et al. (2018a) have shown that the temperature 261 measurements along the northeast sidewall are representative of the vertical 262 temperature structure in the quiescent nocturnal crater atmosphere when dis-263 turbances are restricted to a shallow cold-air intrusion layer over the southwest 264 sidewall. Wind speeds at the crater floor at the bottom of the inversion are 265 weak and wind direction is correspondingly variable. 266

During the night of 16–17 October (IOP 3; Figs. 3d–f), flow separation 267 occurred over the southwest sidewall. Wind speeds at SSW4 are compara-268 tively low, typically below 2 m s^{-1} , and generally decrease at the same time 269 as wind speeds increase at RIM and vice-versa (Fig. 3d). For example, around 270 0030 MST, the wind speed increases at RIM and simultaneously decreases 271 at SSW4. Around 0200 MST, the opposite occurs and the two wind speeds 272 become almost identical for a short period of time, before the wind speed in-273 creases again at RIM and drops to almost 0 m s^{-1} at SSW4. This regime then 274 lasts for almost two hours until about 0400 MST. The wind direction during 275 this period of near-calm conditions turns mostly to a northeasterly upslope 276 direction, indicating a return circulation within the wake region (Fig. 3e). A 277 return circulation, however, does not form during all other flow-separation 278 periods, which could be related to the fact that there is constant forcing for 279 a thermally driven downslope flow opposing the return circulation. In con-280 trast to SSW4, wind speeds at SSW2 are generally high during this night, 281 with winds from a southwesterly, downslope direction, suggesting that the 282 flow reattaches to the surface downstream of the wake. Near-calm winds at 283 FLR are again consistent with a decoupling of the lowest basin atmosphere, 284 although the stability is generally weaker during this night than during the 285 intrusion-dominated night of the 26-27 October (Fig. 3f). Particularly dur-286 ing the two flow-separation periods around 0100 MST and between 0200 and 287 0400 MST, the potential temperature near the crater floor is only slightly 288 lower than in the upper part of the crater, indicating an almost mixed crater 289 atmosphere. During the short break around 0200 MST and after 0400 MST, 290 the temperature in the lower part of the crater drops, leading to the formation 291 of a new crater-floor inversion. 292

²⁹³ While the wake during the night of 16–17 October extends only to SSW4 ²⁹⁴ but not to SSW2, where relatively high wind speeds are observed, larger wakes ²⁹⁵ can also form that extend farther down the southwest sidewall. An example ²⁹⁶ is shown in Figs. 3g–i for the night of 27–28 October. Wind speeds along the ²⁹⁷ southwest sidewall are generally weak, both at SSW4 and SSW2, while wind ²⁹⁸ speeds at RIM exceed 5 m s⁻¹ (Fig. 3g). Wind speeds at FLR are also higher



Fig. 3 Time series of (a,d,g) wind speed and (b,e,h) wind direction at NEAR (3 m AGL), RIM (5 m AGL), SSW4, SSW2, and FLR; (c,f,i) potential temperature (left axes) at different sites running up the northeast sidewall from the crater floor (dark blue) to the rim (dark red) at approximately 10–20 m height intervals and pressure difference between RIM and NEAR (right axes; dashed line) on (a–c) 26–27, (d–f) 16–17, and (g–i) 27–28 October. The colour-coded background is explained in Sect. 4.

than over the sidewall and the wind direction is consistently from the northeast (Fig. 3h), that is, opposing the southwesterly flow over the crater, suggesting the formation of a large crater-sized eddy. This is consistent with a well-mixed crater atmosphere, with a brief exception between 0100 and 0200 MST, when a shallow, about 5 m deep layer cools above the crater floor (Fig. 3i). This short period coincides with slightly reduced wind speed at RIM and near-calm conditions at FLR (Fig. 3g).

306 4 Conditions for Flow Separation

Figure 2 showed that the wind speed within the wake region is generally less 307 than about 2 m s^{-1} . We can thus use this information to identify wake occur-308 rences objectively for further analysis. Because Fig. 2 also shows individual 309 wake events with slightly higher wind speeds than 2 m s^{-1} when the wind 310 speed at the rim is very high, times with wind speeds exceeding 7 m s⁻¹ at 311 the rim are also classified as wakes independent of the wind speed at SSW2 312 and SSW4. Based on this classification scheme and on the information pro-313 vided by the examples in Fig. 3, we define five different categories: (i) A large 314 wake or complete decoupling of the crater atmosphere similar to the night of 315 27–28 October (Figs. 3g–i) is defined when the wind speed at RIM is larger 316 than 7 m s^{-1} or when the wind speeds at both SSW2 and SSW4 are below 317 2 m s^{-1} (WLG—large wake). (ii) A small wake that affects only the upper part 318 of the southwest sidewall similar to the night of 16–17 October (Figs. 3d–f) is 319 defined when the wind speed at rim is less than 7 m s^{-1} and the wind speed at 320 SSW4 is below 2 m s⁻¹, but the wind speed farther down the slope at SSW2321 is larger than 2 m s^{-1} (WSM—small wake). (iii) A cold-air intrusion that does 322 not extend to SSW2 similar to the period shortly after 0300 MST during the 323 night of 26–27 October (Figs. 3a–c) is defined when the wind speed is higher 324 than 2 m s⁻¹ at SSW4 but lower than 2 m s⁻¹ at SSW2 (ISH—shallow in-325 trusion). (iv) A cold-air intrusion that reaches beyond SSW4 similar to, for 326 example, the period after about 0315 MST during the night of 26–27 October 327 (Figs. 3a–c) is defined when the wind speeds at both SSW2 and SSW4 exceed 328 2 m s^{-1} (IDP-deep intrusion). (v) Finally, a quiescent category is defined for 329 those cases when the wind speeds at RIM and at both SSW4 and SSW2 are less 330 than 2 m s⁻¹ (Q—quiescent), which are not likely to be wake cases in spite 331 of the low wind speeds over the southwest sidewall. These five regimes are 332 color-coded throughout the remainder of this paper and added as background 333 colours in the time series of the three case studies, similar to Figs. 2 and 3. 334 The background colors in Fig. 3 thus indicate, for example, an approximately 335 2-h long small wake around 0300 MST on 16-17 October (Figs. 3d-f) and the 336 presence of a large wake during the entire night of 27–28 October (Figs. 3g–i). 337 The criterion for lee-side flow separation defined by Baines (1995) states 338 that the half-length of the obstacle in the lee has to be smaller than the half 339 wavelength of the internal waves excited by the obstacle, that is, $NA_d/U < \pi$, 340 where A_d is the half-width of the obstacle. Using an approximate half-width 341



Fig. 4 Pseudo-vertical potential temperature gradients across (a) the lower 25 m and (b) the top 91 m as a function of N/U at RIM. Potential temperature gradients were calculated from temperature sensors on the northeast sidewall and N and U were averaged over the 40-m tower. The criterion for flow separation by Baines (1995) is indicated by a vertical grey line. Note the different ranges of the potential temperature gradient in two figures.

of 150 m for the Meteor Crater, the resulting N/U is $\pi/150 \approx 0.02$ m⁻¹. 342 Figure 4 shows scatter plots of the stability in the crater, that is, the vertical 343 potential temperature difference across fixed layers, as a function of N/U at 344 RIM, where N and U have been averaged over the 40-m high tower. Potential 345 temperature gradients in the crater are pseudo-vertical gradients, that is, they 346 were calculated from the near-surface temperature measurements along the 347 northeast sidewall. The data show a regime transition around 0.015 m^{-1} , with 348 flow separation occurring for N/U < 0.015 m⁻¹, that is, slightly below the 349 criterion defined by Baines (1995). It has to be kept in mind, however, that N350 and u vary with height and that the mean values are thus only approximations, 351 as is the estimate of A_d . Small wakes, which affect only SSW4, occur at the 352 upper end of this range between about 0.007 and 0.015 m⁻¹. 353

The criterion by Baines (1995) contains the stability upstream or at the 354 crater rim. Strauss et al. (2016), however, suggested that the stability in the 355 valley downstream may also facilitate or prevent flow separation. Although 356 their argument was made for post-wave separation and rotor formation, it is 357 also considered here for bluff-body separation. The nocturnal atmosphere in 358 the Meteor Crater is typically characterized by a strong and shallow inversion 359 at the crater floor, with a close to isothermal layer above (Whiteman et al. 360 2010, 2018b). The pseudo-vertical potential temperature gradients across the 361 lowest 25-m deep layer, that is, within the crater-floor inversion, and across 362 the top 91-m deep layer, that is, within the near-isothermal layer are shown 363 in Fig. 4. The potential temperature gradients were calculated from four hobo 364 temperature sensors on the northeast sidewall, which best represents ambient 365 conditions within the crater. As already seen for the three case studies pre-366 sented in Fig. 3, the stability in the lower part of the crater is much higher 367 during intrusions than during flow separation. Particularly for large wakes, the 368

³⁶⁹ crater atmosphere is close to neutral throughout its entire depth. This is likely ³⁷⁰ a result of increased wind speeds and thus mixing in the crater during this ³⁷¹ flow regime. Small wakes, which only affect the upper part of the southwest ³⁷² crater sidewall, are, however, not likely to lead to a mixing of the entire crater ³⁷³ themselves. Figure 4b shows that their occurrence is usually also accompanied ³⁷⁴ by lower stabilities compared to intrusions, also in the upper, near-isothermal ³⁷⁵ layer, which may thus facilitate flow separation.

Stiperski et al. (2018) analyze vertical profiles upwind of the crater at 376 NEAR and distinguish two different types of katabatic flows approaching the 377 crater. A shallow type with a jet maximum at 15-25 m AGL and a deeper 378 type with the jet maximum near the top of the 50-m tower. The latter is also 379 characterized by weaker directional wind shear with height and weaker near-380 surface stratification. These differences in the katabatic flow profiles can have 381 different effects on the crater atmosphere. While nearly continuous cold-air 382 intrusions over the southwest rim into the crater basin occur during shallow 383 katabatic-flow periods (Whiteman et al. 2018a), large-amplitude waves can 384 form over the basin with increased flow speeds along the southwest sidewall 385 during deep katabatic flows (Adler et al. 2012; Whiteman et al. 2018b). Fig-386 ure 5 shows wind and stability profiles at NEAR and RIM for the five different 387 flow categories. Both intrusion categories and also the quiescent conditions are 388 characterized by a distinct jet profile. The wind profiles show a jet maximum 389 of about 5 m $\rm s^{-1}$ around 25 m AGL at NEAR and a stability maximum at 390 about 15 m AGL for both intrusion regimes. This agrees with the finding by 391 Whiteman et al. (2018a) that flow intrusions occur with a shallow katabatic 392 flow. The wind and stability profiles for the wake cases agree better with the 393 deep katabatic flow described by Stiperski et al. (2018), with a continuous 394 increase in wind speed throughout the height of the 50-m tower and compara-395 tively lower stability. For the large wakes, the 90th percentiles show that cases 396 with much higher wind speeds are possible. The conditions for flow separa-397 tion thus match the conditions for the formation of deep waves and warm-air 398 intrusions over the crater described by Whiteman et al. (2018b). 399

The wind profiles in Fig. 5 show another distinct difference between flow 400 intrusion and flow-separation regimes. For flow intrusions and quiescent condi-401 tions, near-surface wind speeds at NEAR and at RIM are very similar. Above 402 approximately 15 m AGL, however, the wind speed at RIM is lower than at 403 NEAR on average. This flow deceleration was already noticed in the case study 404 of Whiteman et al. (2018a). Figure 3a shows the wind speeds at the first levels 405 at NEAR and RIM for the night studied by Whiteman et al. (2018b), that is, 406 at 3 and 5 m AGL, respectively. Close to the surface, the wind speed remains 407 nearly constant between the upstream site and the crater rim, in agreement 408 with the mean profiles in Fig. 5. In contrast, a mean flow acceleration occurs 409 throughout the entire flow depth from NEAR to RIM during flow-separation 410 cases. This flow acceleration can also be seen in the two case studies with a 411 small and a large wake in Figs. 3d, g. In the latter, a flow acceleration of about 412 $2-3 \text{ m s}^{-1}$ occurs near the surface throughout most of the night. During the 413 night of 16–17 October (Fig. 3d), flow separation is briefly interrupted around 414



Fig. 5 Profiles of the (a–e) downslope wind component and (f–j) Brunt-Väisälä frequency at NEAR (red) and RIM (black) for the five different flow regimes. Profiles are median values and the shading indicates the 10th and 90th percentiles. The downslope wind component u_{ds} was calculated in the direction of the main topographic gradient of the upstream plain, that is, 215°.

0200 MST and then finally ends in the morning around 0430 MST. As men-415 tioned before, these periods correspond to a decrease in wind speed at RIM, 416 which, however, is not reflected in the upstream near-surface wind at NEAR, 417 thus resulting in a reduced flow acceleration. Similarly, a brief drop in wind 418 speed at RIM and thus in the flow acceleration upstream occurred during the 419 night of 27–28 October (Fig. 3g) around 0100 MST together with a decrease 420 in wind speed at FLR and with the development of a basin-floor inversion. 421 As wind speeds remain low at both SSW2 and SSW4 during this time, flow 422 separation is still occurring but only a smaller wake forms. 423

To gain further insight into the flow acceleration or deceleration between 424 NEAR and RIM, the pressure gradient was examined between the two sites. 425 For the determination of the horizontal pressure difference, the pressure at 426 NEAR was extrapolated to the elevation of the pressure measurement at 427 RIM using the hydrostatic equation. The pressure difference between RIM 428 and NEAR is positive throughout the entire night of 26–27 October (Fig. 3c), 429 that is, the pressure gradient opposes the southwesterly katabatic flow, consis-430 tent with the observed flow deceleration. During the nights of 16–17 October 431 (Fig. 3f) and 27–28 October (Fig. 3i), on the other hand, the pressure differ-432 ence is generally closer to zero or even negative. Times with a positive pressure 433 difference match times with lower wind speeds at RIM and thus a break in flow 434



Fig. 6 Pressure difference between RIM and NEAR against mean-wind-speed difference between RIM and NEAR.

separation. Figure 6 shows the upstream change in the layer-averaged wind speed between NEAR and RIM together with the pressure difference between the two sites for all individual 5-min intervals. Flow separation, particularly large wakes affecting the entire southwest sidewall, occur mostly in the lowerright quadrant, where $\Delta p < 0$ and $\Delta U > 0$. This means that flow separation occurs when the pressure decreases towards the rim and the flow accelerates towards the rim. In contrast, flow intrusions occur generally with a flow decoloration. The pressure gradient horizon can point in either direction

celeration. The pressure gradient, however, can point in either direction.

⁴⁴³ 5 Conditions within the Wake Region

When flow separation occurs at the southwest crater rim, a wake forms over 444 the inner southwest sidewall, whose size depends on the flow conditions. The 445 wake is characterized by low wind speeds and sometimes a return circulation 446 near the surface, that is, an upslope flow component (see Sect. 3). In this sec-447 tion, we will further analyze the conditions within the wake region, including 448 its turbulence characteristics, stability, and pressure. Time series of potential 449 temperature along the hobo line running up the SSW sidewall and time series 450 of pressure deviations at several sites along the southwest sidewall are shown in 451 Fig. 7 for the three case studies. The potential temperature time series from 452 the south-southwest crater sidewall are overall very similar to the potential 453 temperature time series from the northeast sidewall shown in Fig. 3, that is, 454 they also show the development of the nocturnal crater inversion, which is 455 disturbed during flow-separation events. In contrast to the northeast sidewall, 456 however, the potential temperatures at the crater rim (indicated by the dark 457 red lines in Fig. 7) are generally not the highest, but rather slightly lower than 458 the potential temperatures in the upper part of the crater atmosphere. This 459

slightly superadiabatic pseudo-vertical profile along the south-southwest side-460 wall has already been described by Whiteman et al. (2018a) for the intrusion 461 case of the 26–27 October (Fig. 7a), who hypothesized that it is caused by 462 turbulent mixing at the bottom of the shallow cold-air intrusion layer. During 463 the night of 16–17 October the superadiabatic layer is even more pronounced, 464 particularly during the first part of the night before the onset of flow sepa-465 ration (Fig. 7c). During the first wake formation around 0100 MST, the su-466 peradiabatic stratification is strongly reduced and the overall pseudo-vertical 467 temperature gradient becomes close to neutral. Interestingly, the crater-floor 468 temperature becomes even higher than the rim temperature when the crater 469 inversion is destroyed by the formation of the wake—that is, a superadiabatic 470 stratification develops in the lower part of the crater. This behaviour is par-471 ticularly pronounced during the night of 27–28 October, when the crater-floor 472 temperature becomes as high as the rim temperature and about 3°C higher 473 than the temperatures along the SSW sidewall (Fig. 7e). 474

Median pseudo-vertical potential temperature profiles (Fig. 8a) along the 475 southwest crater sidewall show that the superadiabatic stratification is also 476 present on average during flow intrusions and during the formation of small 477 wakes, with the wake cases on average colder than the intrusion cases. For 478 completely quiescent cases, the temperature profile is close to the nocturnal 479 temperature profile observed in other small basins under undisturbed condi-480 tions (Clements et al. 2003; Whiteman et al. 2004; Dorninger et al. 2011), with 481 a continuously stably stratified layer to the top of the crater basin. Large wakes 482 occur with strong winds at RIM, resulting in a well mixed crater atmosphere. 483 484

Pressure deviations on the southwest sidewall were calculated with respect 485 to the NNE site on the relatively undisturbed northeast sidewall. To increase 486 the comparability among the individual sites by removing the altitude effect, 487 the mean pressure difference between each site and the NNE site between 488 2300 and 0600 MST was subtracted from the respective time series. With the 489 exception of a weak diurnal trend, particularly at RIM, the pressure remains 490 relatively constant throughout the night of 26–27 October, when no wakes 491 form over the southwest sidewall (Fig. 7b). During the night of 16-17 Oc-492 tober, the pressure along the southwest sidewall is affected by the formation, 493 breakup, and subsequent reformation of the small wake (Fig. 7d). The pressure 494 at RIM, SSW4, and SSW2 drops with the formation of a wake around mid-495 night, increases to a positive peak during the short breakup of the wake around 496 0200 MST and then decreases again. It remains low until about 0400 MST at 497 RIM and SSW4, although the pressure increases already somewhat earlier at 498 SSW2. Even at SSW1 farther down the slope, a short drop in pressure is ob-499 served after 0200 MST. Interestingly, SSW3, which is located between SSW4 500 and SSW2, remains unaffected. Even during the night of 27–28 October, the 501 brief weakening of the wake around 0100 MST, which is indicated by a sta-502 bilization of the crater atmosphere, leads to a brief increase in pressure at all 503 sites (Fig. 7f). Average pressure perturbation profiles (Fig. 8b) suggest that 504 during quiescent conditions and shallow intrusions the pressure is on average 505



Fig. 7 Time series of (a,c,e) potential temperature at different sites running up the southsouthwest hobo line from the crater floor (dark blue) to the rim (dark red) at 10–20 m height intervals and (b,d,f) pressure differences between sites along the southwest sidewall and a site on the opposite north-northeast sidewall on (a,b) 26–27, (c,d) 16–17, and (e,f) 27–28 Oct. The respective mean pressure difference Δp over the 7-h period between 2300 and 0600 MST was subtracted from each pressure time series for better comparability among the sites.



Fig. 8 Pseudo-vertical profiles of median (a) potential temperature and (b) pressure deviations along the south-southwest crater sidewall for the different flow regimes. Pressure deviations were calculated with respect to a reference site on the northeast sidewall and the mean over the period 2300–0600 MST was subtracted for better comparability among the sites. Shading indicates the 10^{th} and 90^{th} percentiles.

higher over the southwest sidewall than over the opposing northeast sidewall 506 in the lower part of the crater, whereas during deeper intrusions and small 507 wakes the pressure gradient reverses. During large wakes, the pressure distri-508 bution is relatively homogeneous. In the upper part of the crater, the pressure 509 over the southwest sidewall is generally higher than over the northeast sidewall 510 independent of the flow regime. It has to be kept in mind, however, that only 511 one reference site, which is located in the lower part of the crater, exists on 512 the northeast sidewall. 513

Turbulence characteristics in the wake region, such as turbulence kinetic energy (TKE), the velocity aspect ratio (Vickers and Mahrt 2006)

$$VAR = \left(\frac{2\overline{w'^2}}{\overline{w'^2} + \overline{v'^2}}\right)^{1/2},\tag{1}$$

momentum fluxes, and the vertical heat flux are shown for the three case studies in Fig. 9 and for the entire month in Fig. 10. In the absence of a wake over the southwest sidewall during the night of 26–27 October, TKE is generally low with the exception of SSW2 (Fig. 9a), which is located near the top of the basin-floor inversion and most of the time at the lower edge of cold-air inflow (Fig. 3a). TKE at SSW2 is dominated by contributions from the horizontal velocity variances $\overline{u'^2}$ and $\overline{v'^2}$. While TKE is generally weak at the other sites,

VAR is closer to 1 at RIM and to a lesser degree at SSW4, meaning that $\overline{w'^2}$ 523 has a similar magnitude as $\overline{u'^2}$ and $\overline{v'^2}$ and turbulence is closer to isotropic. 524 During the night of 16-17 October, TKE at SSW4 reaches values similar to 525 SSW2 (Fig. 9e). This increase in TKE compared to the night of 26–27 Oc-526 tober is due to an increase in the variances of all three velocity components, 527 but particularly after 0200 MST, $\overline{u'^2}$ and $\overline{v'^2}$ increase more strongly than $\overline{w'^2}$, 528 leading to a decrease in VAR. TKE increases strongly at the basin floor and 529 at the crater rim when a large wake forms during the night of 27–28 October, 530 with comparatively low values along the southwest sidewall (Fig. 9i). VAR also 531 remains relatively low during this night (Fig. 9j). 532

The generally low values of TKE at RIM and FLR, with the exception of 533 large wakes when particularly $\overline{u'^2} + \overline{v'^2}$ increases significantly, can be observed 534 throughout the entire month (Figs. 10a, d). On the other hand, large wakes 535 are generally characterized by low TKE at both SSW2 and SSW4 (Figs. 10b, 536 c). For small wakes, the increase in TKE at SSW2 observed during the night of 537 16-17 October is also seen throughout the month (Fig. 10c). At SSW4, how-538 ever, the small wakes show relatively large scatter of both $\overline{w'^2}$ and $\overline{u'^2} + \overline{v'^2}$ 539 (Fig 10b). For intrusions, the analysis of the entire month shows a slightly 540 different picture than just the night of 26–27 October. It can be clearly seen 541 that at SSW4, TKE is generally higher during intrusions than during wake 542 events, with an increase in both $\overline{w'^2}$ and $\overline{u'^2} + \overline{v'^2}$. Similarly, larger TKE val-543 ues occur at SSW2 during deep intrusion events, when the cold-air intrusions 544 actually reach the site, with relatively large scatter during the less deep intru-545 sion events (Fig 10c). In contrast to SSW4, however, the increase in TKE at 546 SSW2 is generally due to in increase in $\overline{u'^2} + \overline{v'^2}$, while $\overline{w'^2}$ remains low. 547

The horizontal momentum fluxes are also influenced by the formation of 548 a wake over the southwest sidewall. The streamwise momentum flux $\overline{u'w'}$ is 549 generally positive at SSW4 and SSW2 during both the night of 26–27 October 550 (intrusions; Fig. 9c) and the night of 16–17 October (small wake; Fig. 9g), 551 with negligible values at RIM and at FLR. As a small wake forms during the 552 night of 16–17 October, $\overline{u'w'}$ increases at SSW2 compared to the intrusion 553 night of 26–27 October, with a weak minimum between 0100 and 0200 MST 554 together with the brief breakup of the wake. The lateral momentum flux v'w'555 increases as well (not shown), but remains small compared to the streamwise 556 component. Based on the wind speed, it had been established that small wakes 557 do not affect SSW2 but only SSW4 farther up the slope. The close correlation 558 between the momentum flux at SSW2 and the timing of the wake, however, 559 suggests that SSW2 is affected, even though the wake does not extend this 560 far down the sidewall. This may be related to another phenomenon, that is, 561 the formation of gravity waves and associated warm-air intrusions (Whiteman 562 et al. 2018b), which form under similar conditions as small wakes. This will 563 be further discussed in Sect. 6. 564

The increase in momentum flux at SSW2 for small wakes can also be seen throughout the month, but with relatively large scatter (Fig. 10g). Increased values in $\overline{u'w'}$ result also from deep intrusions reaching the lower sidewall. At SSW4, positive values of momentum flux are observed during all intrusions and



Fig. 9 Time series of (a,e,i) TKE, (b,f,j) the velocity aspect ratio, (c,g,k) the streamwise momentum flux, and (d,h,l) the vertical heat flux on (a–d) 26–27, (e–h) 16–17, and (i–l) 27–28 Oct.



Fig. 10 (a–d) Contributions of $\overline{u'^2} + \overline{v'^2}$ and $\overline{w'^2}$ to TKE and (e–h) vertical heat flux and streamwise momentum flux at (a,e) RIM, (b,f) SSW4, (c,g) SSW2, and (d,h) FLR.

close to zero or negative values during wakes (Fig. 10f). The generally positive values during intrusions suggest that the cold-air intrusions are extremely shallow, with the highest wind speeds located below the measurement height of 3 m AGL, resulting in an upward momentum transport.

⁵⁷³ During large wakes (e.g., 27–28 October, Fig. 9h) the momentum fluxes ⁵⁷⁴ at RIM and sometimes at FLR can increase in magnitude, with relatively low ⁵⁷⁵ values at the other sites (Fig. 10e–h). However, while the momentum flux at ⁵⁷⁶ RIM remains positive, negative values are equally possible at FLR.

In the vertical heat flux, there is little difference between intrusions and 577 wakes. It is overall negative at all sites, consistent with stable conditions, 578 with values close to zero during intrusions and small wakes (Figs. 9b, d and 579 Figs. 10e-h). Some small positive values are possible at FLR (Fig. 10b). 580 The magnitude of the heat flux is generally independent of the flow regime 581 (Figs. 10e-h). During the night of 27–28 October, however, when a large wake 582 forms, the heat flux increases in magnitude at all sites despite the almost 583 neutral stratification during this time (Fig. 9l). 584

Scintillometer measurements were made across the southwest part of the 585 crater to observe turbulence in the immediate lee of the rim (Fig. 1), where 586 the flow separates from the surface. A time series of the refractive index struc-587 ture parameter C_n^2 is shown in Fig. 11 for the night of 16–17 October. C_n^2 588 is a measure for the spatial variability of the refractive index of air and thus 589 for turbulence intensity. During this night, C_n^2 increased around 0200 MST 590 together with the onset of flow separation, indicating increased turbulence 591 near the top of the crater compared to time periods with flow intrusions. A 592 similar, although much weaker, increase was also observed during the shorter 593



21

Fig. 11 Time series of the refractive index structure parameter on 16–17 Oct. Background color shading as in Fig. 3.

period of flow separation around 0100 MST. A statistical comparison of C_n^2 594 for the five different flow categories for the whole month revealed, however, 595 similar median values for small wakes and the two intrusion categories and 596 even a lower 75 percentile (not shown). Large wakes, on the other hand, have 597 statistically slightly higher C_n^2 values. It is conceivable that the small wakes 598 were oftentimes too shallow to be captured by the scintillometer path. The 599 available measurements during METCRAX II, however, did not allow for a 600 determination of the actual slope-normal wake depth. 601

602 6 Summary and Discussion

Observations have been presented from the METCRAX II field campaign in 603 the approximately 170-m deep and 1.2-km wide Meteor Crater in Arizona 604 that show that wakes can form over the inner southwest crater sidewall. The 605 wakes are characterized by low wind there, but are speeds coincident with 606 relatively high wind speeds at the crater rim and at the crater floor. The 607 Meteor Crater is located on an extensive plain that slopes slightly upwards 608 to the southwest, so that a southwesterly katabatic flow forms in connection 609 with a surface-based inversion during quiescent and undisturbed nights. As 610 the southwesterly katabatic wind flows over the approximately 30–50-m high 611 crater rim, the flow can either run down the southwest sidewall because the 612 air is colder than the ambient crater atmosphere or it can separate from the 613 surface leading to the formation of a wake over the inner sidewall. 614

The analysis has focused on nighttime data from the one-month long mea-615 surement campaign. The data were classified into five different regimes based 616 on wind speed observations at the southwest crater rim and at two sites on 617 the southwest inner sidewall: flow separation with the formation of either (i) 618 large wakes that affect the entire southwest sidewall (WLG) or (ii) small wakes 619 that affect only the upper part of the southwest sidewall (WSM), (iii) deep 620 and (iv) shallow cold-air intrusions when no wake forms but part of the up-621 stream drainage flow runs down the sidewall until it reaches its level of neutral 622 buoyancy (IDP and ISH), and finally, (v) quiescent conditions (Q). Schematic 623



Fig. 12 Schematic diagrams of (a) shallow intrusions, (b) deep intrusions, (c) small wakes, and (d) large wakes. Small black arrows show potential recirculation zones and small red eddies indicate turbulence, with a larger number of eddies indicating higher TKE.

diagrams of the two wake regimes and the two intrusion regimes in Fig. 12 624 summarize the findings from the analysis of the upstream conditions leading to 625 flow separation and the mean and turbulence conditions in the crater, partic-626 ularly within the wake region. The classification scheme is of course strongly 627 site dependent. For example, it is easily conceivable that very small wakes 628 form over the upper part of the crater sidewall that do not even extend to 629 SSW4 and are thus classified as intrusion regimes. Similarly, the classification 630 into deep versus shallow intrusions and large versus small wakes is based on 631 wind-speed observations at SSW2, a site approximately 50 m above the crater 632 floor. Observations at a lower or higher site may lead to different classifica-633 tions. A thorough analysis of a cold-air intrusion dominated night is presented 634 by Whiteman et al. (2018a). As also shown in the work by Whiteman et al. 635 (2018a), cold-air intrusions (Figs. 12a, b) form when the upstream katabatic 636 flow is shallow according to the classification by Stiperski et al. (2018) and the 637 flow decelerates towards the crater. As the lower part of the drainage flow is 638 colder than the crater atmosphere, the cold air can run down the sidewall un-639 til it reaches its level of neutral buoyancy. The location of the level of neutral 640 buoyancy determines whether shallow (Fig. 12a) or deep (Fig. 12b) intrusions 641 form, that is, whether the intrusion reaches to the measurement site in the 642 lower part of the sidewall. The crater atmosphere is typically strongly strat-643 ified in the lowest layer during intrusions, but relatively strong turbulence 644 is observed in the vicinity of the intrusion flow. While the lower part of the 645 southwest sidewall is thus typically characterized by quiescent conditions for 646 shallow intrusions, wind speed and turbulence increase and stability decreases 647 for deep intrusions. 648

For the analysis, a fifth, quiescent regime was defined, which was used to filter out data with overall low wind speeds, both at the crater rim and along the southwest crater sidewall. Based on our classification method, whose main criterion is the wind speed on the sidewall, these data would have otherwise not been distinguishable from the flow separation regimes, which, however, form only under higher wind speeds. The general conditions both upstream (e.g., wind speed and profiles) and in the crater (e.g., stability) during these quiescent periods are very similar to intrusions. This category is thus not a separate physical regime, but rather consists of intrusions under very weak wind conditions.

The occurrence of flow separation and subsequent wake formation generally 659 matches the criterion for bluff-body flow separation by Baines (1995), that is, 660 that the leeside half-length of the obstacle is smaller than the half wavelength 661 of the internal waves excited by the obstacle. Estimating the half-length of 662 the crater sidewall, the resulting criterion becomes $N/U < 0.02 \text{ m}^{-1}$ for the 663 Meteor Crater, that is, flow separation is facilitated by lower stability and 664 higher wind speeds. Observations show that the wind speed at the crater rim 665 plays a crucial role, with flow separation becoming the dominant regime for 666 layer-averaged wind speeds larger than 5 m s⁻¹. The upstream wind profile 667 during conditions leading to flow separation is typically characterized by a deep 668 katabatic flow according to the classification by Stiperski et al. (2018) and the 669 flow accelerates towards the crater, with the horizontal pressure gradient just 670 upwind of the crater rim opposing the direction of the katabatic flow (Figs. 12c, 671 d). 672

Flow separation leading to the formation of small wakes is summarized 673 in Fig. 12c. The slope-normal extent of the wake is probably exaggerated in 674 the schematic diagram. Lidar scans were performed from a site slightly below 675 SSW2, but the small wakes seem to be too small to be seen by the lidar scans. 676 For small wakes, the upper part of the sidewall is characterized by low wind 677 speeds and low turbulence compared to the lower part of the sidewall. While 678 the wake does not extend to the lower part of the sidewall, conditions at the 679 lower sidewall and also at the crater floor still show some correlation with the 680 formation of the wake, for example, increased wind speeds and momentum 681 fluxes and reduced stability. The conditions leading to flow separation and the 682 formation of small wakes are, however, similar to the conditions leading to the 683 formation of deep gravity waves over the crater and the associated downward 684 transport of warm air into the crater from above (Whiteman et al. 2018b). The 685 night analyzed by Whiteman et al. (2018b) (IOP4; 19–20 October) is overall 686 very similar to the night of 16–17 October, that is, our case study for small-687 wake formation. This suggests that small wakes may occur together with a 688 deep wave downstream, which causes the increased wind speeds at SSW2 and 689 the increased mixing and destabilization in the lower part of the crater. An 690 open question is whether the reduced stability in the crater as a result of the 691 gravity waves facilitates flow separation at the rim. Whiteman et al. (2018b) 692 also identified a transitional period when the flow over the crater rim bifurcates 693 leading to a quiescent, wake-like flow region between the two bifurcating flow 694 layers over the southwest part of the crater, which they called a cavity. This 695 cavity, however, is not identical with the wake region identified here, which 696 forms below the intruding flow (Fig. 12c), whereas the cavity is located above 697 the intruding branch of the flow (see their Fig. 11). 698

⁶⁹⁹ With very high wind speeds upstream (more than about 7 m s⁻¹) only ⁷⁰⁰ large wakes form, whereas for lower wind speeds either small or large wakes ⁷⁰¹ can form. A schematic diagram of this regime is presented in Fig. 12d. No

direct observations of the large, crater-size eddy indicated in Fig. 12d are 702 available. Observations from the crater floor, however, show a return circula-703 tion that opposes the southwesterly flow above the crater and pseudo-vertical 704 temperature profiles along the crater sidewalls indicate a well-mixed crater 705 atmosphere. Similar conditions that are representative of our large wake cases 706 were simulated by Katurji et al. (2013), who performed idealized simulations 707 of flow over a basin with a size similar to the Meteor Crater, with high wind 708 speeds of 10 m s^{-1} and neutral stratification. 709

The observation of flow separation at the crater rim has yielded another 710 detail in the understanding of the complex nocturnal flow at the Meteor Crater 711 and the different flow regimes resulting from the interaction of the southwest-712 erly katabatic flow with the crater topography. While the available observa-713 tions have not allowed a direct visualization or a determination of the exact 714 size of the eddy or wake resulting from flow separation, the data have provided 715 a detailed description of the flow characteristics within the wake and down-716 stream of the wake and allowed the analysis of the conditions leading to flow 717 separation at the crater rim. 718

Acknowledgements This research was supported by the National Science Foundations Physical and Dynamic Meteorology Division through Grant AGS-1160730. The contributions from KIT was funded by the International Bureau of BMBF under Grant 01 DM 13002. We thank the many METCRAX II collaborators and volunteers helping in the field, the property owners for field access, and the colleagues who provided additional equipment,

⁷²⁴ who are all listed as either coauthors or in the acknowledgment section of Lehner et al.

725 (2016b).

726 References

- Adler B, Whiteman CD, Hoch SW, Lehner M, Kalthoff N (2012) Warm-air
 intrusions in Arizona's Meteor Crater. J Appl Meteorol Climat 51:1010–
- ⁷²⁹ 1025, DOI 10.1175/JAMC-D-11-0158.1
- Ambaum MHP, Marshall DP (2005) The effects of stratification on flow sep aration. J Atmos Sci 62:2618–2625, DOI 10.1175/JAS3485.1
- ⁷³² Arya SPS, Capuano ME, Fagen LC (1987) Some fluid modeling studies of
- flow and dispersion over two-dimensional low hills 21:753–764, DOI 10.1016/
- 734 0004-6981(87)90071-0
- Baines PG (1995) Topographic Effects in Stratified Flow. Cambridge Univer sity Press
- ⁷³⁷ Baines PG, Hoinka KP (1985) Stratified flow over two-dimensional topography
- ⁷³⁸ in fluid of infinite depth: A laboratory simulation. J Atmos Sci 42:1614–1630,
 ⁷³⁹ DOI 10.1175/1520-0469(1985)042(1614:SFOTDT)2.0.CO;2
- Batchelor GK (1967) An Introduction to Fluid Dynamics. Cambridge Univer sity Press, DOI 10.1017/CBO9780511800955
- 742 Belcher SE, Hunt JCR (1998) Turbulent flow over hills and waves. Ann Rev
- ⁷⁴³ Fluid Mech 30:507–538, DOI 10.1146/annurev.fluid.30.1.507

- Clements CB, Whiteman CD, Horel JD (2003) Cold-air-pool structure and 744
- evolution in a mountain basin: Peter Sinks, Utah. J Appl Meteorol 42:752-745
- 768, DOI 10.1175/1520-0450(2003)042(0752:CSAEIA)2.0.CO;2 746
- Dorninger M, Whiteman CD, Bica B, Eisenbach S, Pospichal B, Steinacker 747 R (2011) Meteorological events affecting cold-air pools in a small basin. J
- Appl Meteorol Climat 50:2223–2234, DOI 10.1175/2011JAMC2681.1 749
- Doyle JD, Durran DR (2002) The dynamics of mountain-wave-induced rotors. 750 J Atmos Sci 59:186–201, DOI 10.1175/1520-0469(2002)059(0186:TDOMWI) 751
- 2.0.CO;2 752
- Doyle JD, Durran DR (2007) Rotor and subrotor dynamics in the lee of three-753
- dimensional terrain. J Atmos Sci 64:4202–4221, DOI 10.1175/2007JAS2352. 754 1
- 755
- French JR, Haimov SJ, Oolman LD, Grubišić V, Serafin S, Strauss L (2015) 756
- Wave-induced boundary layer separation in the lee of the Medicine Bow 757 Mountains. part I: Observations. J Atmos Sci 72:4845–4863, DOI 10.1175/ 758
- JAS-D-14-0376.1 759
- Gerber F, Lehning M, Hoch SW, Mott R (2017) A close-ridge small-scale 760 atmospheric flow field and its influence on snow accumulation. J Geophys 761 Res Atm 122:7737-7754, DOI 10.1002/2016JD026258 762
- Grubišić V, Doyle JD (2006) Terrain-induced Rotor Experiment. In: 12th Con-763
- ference on Mountain Meteorology, American Meteorological Society, Santa 764 Fe, New Mexico, USA 765
- Haiden T, Whiteman CD, Hoch SW, Lehner M (2011) A mass flux model of 766 nocturnal cold-air intrusions into a closed basin. J Appl Meteorol Climat
- 767 50:933–943, DOI 10.1175/2010JAMC2540.1 768
- Hertenstein RF, Kuettner JP (2005) Rotor types associated with steep lee 769 topography: influence of the wind profile. Tellus 57A:117–135, DOI 10.1111/ 770 j.1600-0870.2005.00099.x 771
- Holden JJ, Derbyshire SH, Belcher SE (2000) Tethered balloon observations 772 of the nocturnal stable boundary layer in a valley. Boundary-Layer Meteorol 773 97:1-24, DOI 10.1023/A:1002628924673 774
- Jackson PL, Mayr G, Vosper S (2012) Dynamically-driven winds. In: Chow 775 FK, DeWekker SFJ, Snyder B (eds) Mountain Weather Research and Fore-776
- casting, Springer, Berlin, chap 3, 121–218 777
- Katurji M, Zhong S, Kiefer M, Zawar-Reza P (2013) Numerical simulations 778 of turbulent flow within and in the wake of a small basin. J Geophys Res 779 118:6052–6063, DOI 10.1002/jgrd.50519 780
- Kim JJ, Baik JJ, Chun HY (2001) Two-dimensional numerical modeling of 781 flow and dispersion in the presence of hill and buildings. J Wind Eng Ind 782 Aerodyn 89:947-966, DOI 10.1016/S0167-6105(01)00092-7 783
- Lehner M, Rotunno R, Whiteman CD (2016a) Flow regimes over a basin 784 induced by upstream katabatic flows—an idealized modeling study. J Atmos 785 Sci 73:3821-3842, DOI 10.1175/JAS-D-16-0114.1
- 786
- Lehner M, Whiteman CD, Hoch SW, Crosman ET, Jeglum ME, Cherukuru 787 NW, Calhoun R, Adler B, Kalthoff N, Rotunno R, Horst TW, Sem-
- 788 mer S, Brown WOJ, Oncley SP, Vogt R, Grudzielanek AM, Cermak J, 789

- ⁷⁹⁰ Fonteyne NJ, Bernhofer C, Pitacco A, Klein P (2016b) The METCRAX
- II field experiment—a study of downslope windstorm-type flows in Ari zona's Meteor Crater. Bull Amer Meteorol Soc 97:217-235, DOI 10.1175/
- ⁷⁹³ BAMS-D-14-00238.1
- Mason PJ (1987) Diurnal variations in flow over a succession of ridges and
 valleys. Q J R Meteorol Soc 113:1117–1140, DOI 10.1002/qj.49711347804
- ⁷⁹⁶ Menke R, Vasiljević N, Mann J, Lundquist JK (2018) Characterisation of
- recirculation zones in complex terrain using multi-lidar measurements. In:
 AMS 18th Conference on Mountain Meteorology
- Patton EG, Katul GG (2009) Turbulent pressure and velocity perturbations
 induced by gentle hills covered with sparse and dense canopies. Boundary-
- Layer Meteorol 133:189–217, DOI 10.1007/s10546-009-9427-x
- Poggi D, Katul GG (2007) Turbulent flows on forested hilly terrain: the recirculation region. Q J R Meteorol Soc 133:1027–1039, DOI 10.1002/qj.73
- Rotunno R, Lehner M (2016) Two-layer stratified flow past a valley. J Atmos
 Sci 73:4065–4076, DOI 10.1175/JAS-D-16-0132.1
- ⁸⁰⁶ Smolarkiewicz PK, Rotunno R (1989) Low Froude number flow past three-
- dimensional obstacles. part I: Baroclinically generated lee vortices. J At-
- mos Sci 46:1154–1164, DOI 10.1175/1520-0469(1989)046(1154:LFNFPT)2. 0.CO;2
- Stiperski I, Whiteman CD, Holtslag AAM, Lehner M, Hoch SW (2018) On the
 turbulence structure, dominant scales and scaling of deep katabatic flows on
 a shallow mesoscale slope. Q J R Meteorol Soc in preparation
- Strauss L, Serafin S, Haimov S, Grubišić V (2015) Turbulence in breaking
 mountain waves and atmospheric rotors estimated from airborne in situ
 and Doppler radar measurements. Q J R Meteorol Soc 141:3207–3225, DOI
 10.1002/qj.2604
- Strauss L, Serafin S, Grubišić V (2016) Atmospheric rotors and severe turbulence in a long deep valley. J Atmos Sci 73:1481–1506, DOI 10.1175/
 JAS-D-15-0192.1
- Vickers D, Mahrt L (2006) A solution for flux contamination by mesoscale
 motions with very weak turbulence. Boundary-Layer Meteorol 118:431–447,
 DOI 10.1007/s10546-005-9003-y
- Voigt M, Wirth V (2013) Mechanisms of banner cloud formation. J Atmos Sci
 70:3631–3640, DOI 10.1175/JAS-D-12-0353.1
- Vosper SB (2004) Inversion effects on mountain lee waves. Q J R Meteorol Soc
 130:1723–1748, DOI 10.1256/qj.03.63
- Whiteman CD, Eisenbach S, Pospichal B, Steinacker R (2004) Comparison
 of vertical soundings and sidewall air temperature measurements in a small
- ⁸²⁹ Alpine basin. J Appl Meteorol 43:1635–1647, DOI 10.1175/JAM2168.1
- ⁸³⁰ Whiteman CD, Muschinski A, Zhong S, Fritts D, Hoch SW, Hahnenberger M,
- Yao W, Hohreiter V, Behn M, Cheon Y, Clements CB, Horst TW, Brown
- WOJ, Oncley SP (2008) METCRAX 2006—Meteorological experiments in
 Arizona's Meteor Crater. Bull Amer Meteorol Soc 89:1665–1680, DOI 10.
- Arizona's Meteor Crater.
 1175/2008BAMS2574.1

- 835 Whiteman CD, Hoch SW, Lehner M, Haiden T (2010) Nocturnal cold air
- intrusions into a closed basin: Observational evidence and conceptual model.
- ⁸³⁷ J Appl Meteorol Climat 49:1894–1905, DOI 10.1175/2010JAMC2470.1
- ⁸³⁸ Whiteman CD, Lehner M, Hoch SW, Adler B, Kalthoff N, Haiden T (2018a)
- Katabatically driven cold air intrusions into a basin atmosphere. J Appl
 Meteorol Climat 57:435-455, DOI 10.1175/JAMC-D-17-0131.1
- ⁸⁴¹ Whiteman CD, Lehner M, Hoch SW, Adler B, Kalthoff N, Vogt R, Feigenwin-
- $_{\tt 842}$ ter I, , Haiden T, Hills MOG (2018b) The nocturnal evolution of atmospheric
- structure in a basin as a larger-scale katabatic flow is lifted over its rim. J
- Appl Meteorol Climat 57:969–989, DOI 10.1175/JAMC-D-17-0156.1
- Wilczak JM, Oncley SP, Stage SA (2001) Sonic anemometer tilt correction
 algorithms. Boundary-Layer Meteorol 99:127–150
- ⁸⁴⁷ Wirth V, Kristen M, Leschner M, Reuder J, Schween JH (2012) Banner clouds
- observed at Mount Zugspitze. Atmos Chem Phys 12:3611–3625, DOI 10.
- ⁸⁴⁹ 5194/acp-12-3611-2012
- ⁸⁵⁰ Wood N (1995) The onset of separation in neutral, turbulent flow over hills.
- 851 Boundary-Layer Meteorol 76:137–164, DOI 10.1007/BF00710894